

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-98

BEACHWOOD CITY COUNCIL MINUTES OF THE COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING HELD AT BEACHWOOD CITY HALL, CONFERENCE ROOM A, 25325 FAIRMOUNT BOULEVARD, BEACHWOOD, OHIO HELD ON MONDAY, MARCH 14, 2016 AT 5:30 P.M.

The meeting was called to order at 5:31 P.M. by Council President Martin S. Horwitz.

ROLL CALL: Present: J. Berns, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson,
M.M. Jacobs, B. Bellin Janovitz, B. Linick, J. Pasch
Absent: None.
Not present: None.
Also Present: Mayor Gorden, Captain Corpora, Fire fighter
Liggett, Chief Winebrenner, Patrol Officer Grein

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE

1. Fire Station Update/Review.

Mr. Horwitz stated that the purpose of tonight's meeting was to update the newest members of Council on the decisions faced regarding the new proposed Fire Station and the New Proposed Dispatch Center.

Mr. Horwitz stated that he would like a short review on the proposals.

Chief Kearns stated that Captain Corpora and Fire fighter Liggett, have a PowerPoint presentation and would like all questions held until the end. (PowerPoint Presentation is attached.)

Captain Corpora concluded the PowerPoint presentation and stated that the final design was expected in May or June and bid authorization would be requested in July.

Mr. Jacobs asked what the projected call volume is for the proposed area.

Chief Kearns stated that a five to seven percent increase was expected.

Mr. Isaacson asked about the projections of call volume for this year.

Chief Kearns stated that there has been a seven to ten percent increase between 2015 and 2016.

Mr. Horwitz asked Chief Kearns to explain the calls from Metro and Ahuja.

Chief Kearns stated that those calls from Metro and Ahuja are strictly for transport to another appropriate facility.

Mrs. Janovitz asked why the proposed station is twenty eight thousand square feet.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Chief Kearns explained that he did not design the square footage, the architect did.

Mrs. Janovitz asked why so much square footage is needed compared to other Cities such as Cleveland that has smaller stations.

Chief Kearns stated that Cleveland has smaller stations because they have thirty stations as opposed to a City with three.

Chief Kearns stated that everything cannot be put at one end of town and that the City has outgrown the twenty two thousand square feet of fire station number two.

Mr. Berns stated that he was concerned about the residences who were further away.

Chief Kearns stated that time studies were done where rush hour was considered. It took the City's largest fire truck three minutes and forty seven seconds at four o'clock in the afternoon.

Mr. Berns stated that Captain Corpora had mentioned fire poles in his presentation.

Mr. Berns asked why there was a proposed fire pole in the new station plans.

Chief Kearns stated that originally it was thought that the fire poles were causing injuries but it is the steps that are causing the most injuries. Fire poles are safer than slides or steps. The slides were causing lower tailbone injuries.

Mr. Berns asked about the doors that are proposed for installation.

Chief Kearns stated that the doors are Hurricane Doors and that can be opened with one finger. They are not completely electric and can be opened manually.

Mr. Berns asked why the fire station was being built on this site.

Chief Kearns stated that several sites were looked at and that the City already owned this site. It would cost the City millions of dollars to buy a new site.

Mrs. Janovitz asked how much of the site will be used and how much of the site will be used for further expansion.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-100

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Chief Kearns stated that twenty five to thirty percent of the property will not be used and some of the space is office and will not be built out currently. The rest of the site is fire fighter and administrative parking.

Mr. Horwitz asked if the Wetlands issue had been resolved.

Chief Kearns stated that since the City has bought the land, the criterion has changed.

Chief Kearns stated that it does not have to be wet to be wetlands.

Chief Kearns stated that the land can only be cleared after March 31st and before September 20th

Chief Kearns stated that the City is working with the Army Corps of Engineers to clear the land but the City needs a permit.

Mr. Jacobs asked if there was a timeline to build.

Chief Kearns stated that the City should receive the required permit by midsummer.

Chief Kearns stated that the Wetlands are only being cleared for the fire station.

Mr. Isaacson asked if Council would have an opportunity to amend the legislation.

Mr. Linick stated that there would be a process to amend the legislation.

Mr. Isaacson asked how the City can avoid running out of space again.

Chief Kearns stated that extra space has been added to accommodate projected personnel gains over twenty five years.

Chief Kearns stated that within two full years, two full fire stations will be needed.

Mr. Horwitz asked why station two and the area around station two was unable to be built on.

Chief Kearns stated that if we want to build anywhere else it will cost millions of dollars. Station two sits on one half acre of land. It is not feasible to run an operation out of station two. Station two was not built as a fire station.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-101

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mayor Gorden stated that more land is needed and that it does not make sense to take down space that is already occupied.

Mr. Horwitz asked if there were any other stations that can be compared to the proposed station.

Chief Kearns stated that there have been additions but nothing has ever been built to compare.

Mr. Berns asked if the City could just sell the land.

Chief Kearns stated that the Army Corps of Engineers has told the City that if there is a permit given then the station will be built to the proposed drawings.

Mr. Reali stated that it would be up to the next owner for the Army Corps of Engineers to approve.

Mr. Pasch stated that the two most important things are response times and the health and safety to firefighters.

Mr. Pasch asked what can be done to mitigate those statistics.

Chief Kearns stated that the bay floor ventilation has to be different from the living space ventilation and that we need to invest in facilities that cut down on worker's compensation claims.

Mayor Gorden stated that the area was developing and the land was purchased with the intent of providing City services.

Mrs. Janovitz asked if the City was prepared to compensate if the bid is higher than the six million.

Chief Kearns stated that value engineering is different than the design.

Mayor Gorden stated that this has to go to bid for an exact price.

Mr. Isaacson asked if a soil study had been done at the site.

2016-102

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Chief Kearns stated that some bore testing has been done and some excavation will need to be done.

Mr. Linick stated that he would like to hear from Chief Kearns or Mayor Gorden if this was the best option.

Mayor Gorden stated that this was the best option available and that no money has been lost.

Mayor Gorden stated that the concern has been the safety of the community and the land is not driving the need.

2. Dispatch Center Update/Review

Mr. Horwitz stated that he would like to go back to the beginning of the project.

Chief Winebrenner stated that five years ago Beachwood explored with other cities for a regional dispatch center.

Officer Grein stated that the City of Euclid was in a spot where they could no longer wait.

Officer Grein stated that initially it was agreed that Beachwood would run the center. The cities could not come to an agreement and the dispatch center was left in the same position as it was in 2011 and 2012.

Officer Grein presented a PowerPoint outlining the improvements that need to be made to the current dispatch center. (PowerPoint Presentation is attached.)

Officer Grein stated that the 911 systems were replaced by the County.

Officer Grein stated that the jailing board system needs to be replaced. It is at a point where it cannot be repaired.

Chief Winebrenner stated that with the current Dispatch Center, it is very difficult to go in and do construction or repairs.

Mrs. Janovitz asked how many dispatchers were on shift.

Officer Grein stated that there are always three and occasionally there are four.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-103

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mr. Horwitz stated that with the new Dispatch Center there would be a potential for at least eight on shift.

Officer Grein stated that there could be the potential for fourteen.

Mr. Berns asked if there was still a possibility for regionalization.

Mayor Gorden stated that it is still available to bring other regions into Beachwood.

Chief Winebrenner stated that the cost of construction for the new Dispatch Center would be Eight Hundred-Ninety Thousand Dollars. (\$890,000.00)

Mr. Isaacson stated that he would like to speak with other regions and that he would really like to sit down with Chagrin Valley Dispatch and do a side by side comparison.

Mr. Jacobs stated that Chief Winebrenner is the expert.

Chief Winebrenner stated that there were a lot of factors taken into consideration.

Mr. Isaacson stated that those factors would be discovered in a side by side comparison and he does not think an educated decision could not be made without that.

Mayor Gorden stated that Council needs to approve whatever recommendation was given. Council can either deny or agree.

Mr. Isaacson stated that he has not made up his mind. This is about more than the dollars and cents. It is Council's responsibility to have all the information.

Mr. Isaacson stated that there is a need for numbers.

Mr. Horwitz stated that two years ago regionalization was a good idea and that those four or five cities have decided there is some wisdom to join together.

Mr. Horwitz asked what separates us from the others. Are there specific things that the Beachwood Dispatch Center does that other Dispatch Centers do not?

Chief Winebrenner stated that he felt like joining a regional dispatch center was in the City's best interest he would regionalize.

Chief Winebrenner stated that it is a better idea to stay in Beachwood where the employees have a vested interest in the community.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mr. Horwitz asked what the vested interest was.

Chief Kearns stated that he feels like he has a vested interest in the community. He spends more time in this City than with his wife and children.

Mr. Linick stated that he hopes to not disparage other cities from joining Beachwood.

Mr. Pasch stated that there is a point to Mr. Horwitz first statement. Council believed that regionalization was a good idea if Beachwood was the hub.

Mr. Pasch stated that he does not disagree with Mr. Isaacson. Mr. Pasch believes that there was no other choice presented to Council.

Mr. Pasch stated that Council should be able to look at the administration's recommendation.

Mr. Pasch stated that there was no option B presented and that the current option does not provide enough adequate information.

Mr. Pasch stated that he does not even know what services would be offered if the City regionalized.

Mr. Pasch stated that he did not understand why there is no information given for regionalization.

Mr. Linick stated that Council has to be able to trust that the City has done the work and has done the research.

Mr. Pasch stated that Council needs a recommendation and a second option.

Officer Grein stated that the City cannot wait much longer to redo dispatch.

Officer Grein stated that it has to be done.

Mr. Linick asked if there was equipment that could be bought to buy time on a study.

Officer Grein stated that there was a lot of demolition that needed to be done and that there is an immediate need for a new center.

Mr. Berns stated that he would like for the other members of Council to take a tour of the current dispatch center.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-105

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mr. Isaacson asked if the new gear is going to need data center cooling.

Officer Grein stated that the gear would just need room air.

Mr. Linick asked the status of the funding.

Mayor Gorden stated that there was no additional funding other than the City's current customer and the he is not one hundred percent sure about the grant money.

Mr. Linick asked if there was any other funding being used.

Mr. Linick asked if we could use forfeiture money.

Officer Grein stated that other funding was being used for equipment only.

Mr. Berns stated that dispatch does things for Service and other departments.

Chief Winebrenner stated that was correct.

Mr. Horwitz stated that he would like a comparable cost.

Mr. Pasch stated that he would like a full comparison.

Mr. Horwitz stated that a request for a comparison would not be unreasonable.

Mayor Gorden stated that certain members of Council have been given certain information and that Council does have a lot of the information.

Mr. Isaacson stated that Council does have some information but not all and that he still has questions and would like to ask outside dispatch experts for side by side comparison.

Mr. Pasch stated that a great example of not having all of the information is the fact that he did not know that dispatch provided support to the Service Department.

Officer Grein stated that he is being asked by Council to sit down and point out flaws from other dispatch locations.

Officer Grein stated that he would hate to criticize a counterpart.

Mayor Gorden stated that he understands the difficulty of making decisions.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-106

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mayor Gorden stated that in the past Council has taken experts opinions and used them. No bad decisions have come yet.

Mr. Horwitz asked if someone else could monitor our police car live video.

Officer Grein stated no. Beachwood is unique in that we stream live video to dispatch and car to car.

Officer Grein stated that he is afraid to create animosity and understands that Council is doing their due diligence and that the cost savings is gone.

Mayor Gorden asked what more can the administration do to help Council make a decision.

Mr. Berns stated that he would like for dispatch not to leave the City.

Mr. Berns stated that Beachwood is often looked at by surrounding communities and that others will come to Beachwood.

Mr. Jacobs stated that what is being talked about with the fire station and dispatch center is the safety of the community. Council is trying to nickel and dime and if we can talk about football fields we need to talk about community health and safety.

Mr. Pasch stated that the question is not about dollars and cents. The issue is more information needs to be given for comparison.

Mr. Isaacson stated that when he first started to study this project, he started looking at the numbers.

Mr. Isaacson stated that he has reached the limits of his understanding and needs a final expert opinion.

Chief Winebrenner asked how to discount the lies from the truth when someone is telling you what you want to hear.

Mr. Isaacson stated that at that point, the experts would say yes or no.

Mr. Linick stated that perhaps the few Council Members with questions should speak with Chief Winebrenner individually.

March 14, 2016

CM 2016-107

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE (continued)

Mr. Isaacson stated that he thinks that there is more information that needs to be given to Council.

Mr. Linick asked if there was any City that did not regionalize for financial difficulties.

Mayor Gorden stated that it is believed that regionalization was done out of necessity.

Officer Grein stated that regional dispatch is done out of necessity.

Officer Grein stated that some communities do not have the money for upfront costs and repairs.

Mr. Horwitz stated that perhaps Council hold off on any decisions until more information is given.

ADJOURNMENT

Moved by J. Berns, seconded by B. Linick at 8:25 P.M. to adjourn the Committee of the Whole Meeting to the next regularly scheduled Council meeting.

ROLL CALL Yes:	J. Berns, M.S. Horwitz, A. Isaacson, M.M. Jacobs, B. B. Janovitz, B. Linick, J. Pasch
Abstain:	None.
No:	None.
Not Voting:	None.

MOTION ADOPTED

Approved:

Merle S. Gorden, Mayor

Whitney M. Crook, Assistant Clerk of Council